

Subject: RE: Submission
Date: Tuesday, September 15, 2020 at 10:23:42 AM Singapore Standard Time
From: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>
To: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>
Attachments: image001.jpg, image009.jpg, image010.jpg, image011.jpg, image012.jpg, image013.jpg, image014.jpg, image015.jpg

Dear Dr Helmy

You have made a number of allegations in your e-mail. I would like to have a discussion with you to clarify your allegations concerning research integrity. Please let me know what times you are free tomorrow (Wednesday).

I believe that you will be contacted separately about the other matters.

Thanks

Roderick Bates
Associate Professor
Research Integrity Officer

From: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>
Sent: Friday, 11 September 2020 11:14 AM
To: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>; Roderick Wayland Bates (Assoc Prof) <Roderick@ntu.edu.sg>; Chief, Legal & Secretarial <D-LSO@ntu.edu.sg>; Joanna Foong Chi Yuen <JoannaFoong@ntu.edu.sg>; Adrian Chiew Choong Yee <adrian.chiew@ntu.edu.sg>; Esther Quek (OHR) <esther.quek@ntu.edu.sg>; #CHUA EILEEN# <EILEENCHUA@e.ntu.edu.sg>; Hayley Ng <hayley.ng@ntu.edu.sg>
Subject: Submission

To Human Resources, Legal and Secretarial Office, and Research Integrity and Ethics Office,

This concerns NTU Research Integrity Policy, Harassment Policy, and The University Code of Conduct. I would be very grateful for your urgent advice as I may become implicated in violations of NTU policy.

Please find a submission attached in two files (Main.pdf and Appendix.pdf).

Kind regards,
Mohamed Helmy



Mohamed Helmy, MD PhD
Research Fellow, School of Biological Sciences

50 Nanyang Avenue, School of Biological Sciences (SBS), Singapore 639798
T +65 83 555 817 mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg www.ntu.edu.sg



CONFIDENTIALITY: This email is intended solely for the person(s) named and may be confidential and/or privileged. If you are not the intended recipient, please delete it, notify us and do not copy, use, or disclose its contents.

Towards a sustainable earth: Print only when necessary. Thank you.

Subject: RE: Submission
Date: Tuesday, September 15, 2020 at 3:40:51 PM Singapore Standard Time
From: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>
To: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>
Attachments: image001.jpg, image017.jpg, image018.jpg, image019.jpg, image020.jpg, image021.jpg, image022.jpg, image023.jpg, image024.jpg, image025.jpg, image026.jpg, image027.jpg, image028.jpg, image029.jpg, image030.jpg, image031.jpg

Dear Dr Helmy

We can meet online. If you have a gmail address, I can set up a google meeting, otherwise, we can use skype. Let me know.

Rod Bates

From: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>
Sent: Tuesday, 15 September 2020 2:41 PM
To: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>
Subject: Re: Submission

Dear Professor Bates,

Thank you for your message, my apologies for the delay in reply.

I am eager to discuss my allegations with you.

I will be at your disposal 14.30 tomorrow (Wednesday). If earlier or later would suit you better, please let me know, I will be there.

I understand your office and laboratory is at the *School of Physical and Mathematical Sciences, Division of Chemistry and Biological Chemistry*, 21 Nanyang Link, 637371?

If I misunderstood and should be at the *President's Office, Administration Building*, 50 Nanyang Avenue, 639798, please let me know.

My phone number is 83 555 817.

I look forward to meeting you.

Kind regards,
Helmy



Mohamed Helmy, MD PhD
Research Fellow, School of Biological Sciences

50 Nanyang Avenue, School of Biological Sciences (SBS), Singapore 639798
T +65 83 555 817 mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg www.ntu.edu.sg



From: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>
Date: Tuesday, September 15, 2020 at 10:24 AM
To: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>
Subject: RE: Submission

Dear Dr Helmy

You have made a number of allegations in your e-mail. I would like to have a discussion with you to clarify your allegations concerning research integrity. Please let me know what times you are free tomorrow (Wednesday).

I believe that you will be contacted separately about the other matters.

Thanks

Roderick Bates
Associate Professor
Research Integrity Officer

From: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>
Sent: Friday, 11 September 2020 11:14 AM
To: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>; Roderick Wayland Bates (Assoc Prof) <Roderick@ntu.edu.sg>; Chief, Legal & Secretarial <D-LSO@ntu.edu.sg>; Joanna Foong Chi Yuen <JoannaFoong@ntu.edu.sg>; Adrian Chiew Choong Yee <adrian.chiew@ntu.edu.sg>; Esther Quek (OHR) <esther.quek@ntu.edu.sg>; #CHUA EILEEN# <EILEENCHUA@e.ntu.edu.sg>; Hayley Ng <hayley.ng@ntu.edu.sg>
Subject: Submission

To Human Resources, Legal and Secretarial Office, and Research Integrity and Ethics Office,

This concerns NTU Research Integrity Policy, Harassment Policy, and The University Code of Conduct. I would be very grateful for your urgent advice as I may become implicated in violations of NTU policy.

Please find a submission attached in two files (Main.pdf and Appendix.pdf).

Kind regards,
Mohamed Helmy



Mohamed Helmy, MD PhD
Research Fellow, School of Biological Sciences

50 Nanyang Avenue, School of Biological Sciences (SBS), Singapore 639798
T +65 83 555 817 mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg www.ntu.edu.sg



CONFIDENTIALITY: This email is intended solely for the person(s) named and may be confidential and/or privileged. If you are not the intended recipient, please delete it, notify us and do not copy, use, or disclose its contents.

Towards a sustainable earth: Print only when necessary. Thank you.

Subject: RE: Submission
Date: Tuesday, September 15, 2020 at 4:01:46 PM Singapore Standard Time
From: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>
To: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>
Attachments: image001.jpg, image002.jpg, image003.jpg, image004.jpg, image005.jpg, image006.jpg, image007.jpg, image008.jpg, image009.jpg, image010.jpg, image011.jpg, image012.jpg, image013.jpg, image014.jpg, image015.jpg, image016.jpg

I will send you a google meeting link tomorrow afternoon shortly before 2.30

Rod Bates

From: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>
Sent: Tuesday, 15 September 2020 3:46 PM
To: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>
Subject: Re: Submission

Dear Professor Bates,

My gmail address is helmy.m@gmail.com

My Skype address is live:mmmhelmy_1

Kind regards,
Helmy

From: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>
Date: Tuesday, September 15, 2020 at 3:42 PM
To: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>
Subject: RE: Submission

Dear Dr Helmy

We can meet online. If you have a gmail address, I can set up a google meeting, otherwise, we can use skype. Let me know.

Rod Bates

From: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>
Sent: Tuesday, 15 September 2020 2:41 PM
To: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>
Subject: Re: Submission

Dear Professor Bates,

Thank you for your message, my apologies for the delay in reply.

I am eager to discuss my allegations with you.

I will be at your disposal 14.30 tomorrow (Wednesday). If earlier or later would suit you better, please let

me know, I will be there.

I understand your office and laboratory is at the *School of Physical and Mathematical Sciences, Division of Chemistry and Biological Chemistry*, 21 Nanyang Link, 637371?

If I misunderstood and should be at the *President's Office, Administration Building*, 50 Nanyang Avenue, 639798, please let me know.

My phone number is 83 555 817.

I look forward to meeting you.

Kind regards,
Helmy



Mohamed Helmy, MD PhD
Research Fellow, School of Biological Sciences

50 Nanyang Avenue, School of Biological Sciences (SBS), Singapore 639798
T +65 83 555 817 mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg www.ntu.edu.sg



From: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>
Date: Tuesday, September 15, 2020 at 10:24 AM
To: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>
Subject: RE: Submission

Dear Dr Helmy

You have made a number of allegations in your e-mail. I would like to have a discussion with you to clarify your allegations concerning research integrity. Please let me know what times you are free tomorrow (Wednesday).

I believe that you will be contacted separately about the other matters.

Thanks

Roderick Bates
Associate Professor
Research Integrity Officer

From: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>
Sent: Friday, 11 September 2020 11:14 AM
To: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>; Roderick Wayland Bates (Assoc Prof) <Roderick@ntu.edu.sg>; Chief, Legal & Secretarial <D-LSO@ntu.edu.sg>; Joanna Foong Chi Yuen <JoannaFoong@ntu.edu.sg>; Adrian Chiew Choong Yee <adrian.chiew@ntu.edu.sg>; Esther Quek (OHR) <esther.quek@ntu.edu.sg>; #CHUA EILEEN# <EILEENCHUA@e.ntu.edu.sg>; Hayley Ng <hayley.ng@ntu.edu.sg>

Subject: Submission

To Human Resources, Legal and Secretarial Office, and Research Integrity and Ethics Office,

This concerns NTU Research Integrity Policy, Harassment Policy, and The University Code of Conduct. I would be very grateful for your urgent advice as I may become implicated in violations of NTU policy.

Please find a submission attached in two files (Main.pdf and Appendix.pdf).

Kind regards,
Mohamed Helmy



Mohamed Helmy, MD PhD
Research Fellow, School of Biological Sciences

50 Nanyang Avenue, School of Biological Sciences (SBS), Singapore 639798
T +65 83 555 817 mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg www.ntu.edu.sg



CONFIDENTIALITY: This email is intended solely for the person(s) named and may be confidential and/or privileged. If you are not the intended recipient, please delete it, notify us and do not copy, use, or disclose its contents.

Towards a sustainable earth: Print only when necessary. Thank you.

Subject: Re: Submission
Date: Wednesday, September 16, 2020 at 2:21:53 PM Singapore Standard Time
From: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>
To: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>
Attachments: image001.jpg, image002.jpg, image003.jpg, image004.jpg, image005.jpg, image006.jpg, image007.jpg, image008.jpg, image009.jpg, image010.jpg, image011.jpg, image012.jpg, image013.jpg, image014.jpg, image015.jpg, image016.jpg

here is the Google meeting link: meet.google.com/pfi-hfxc-rdp

RB

From: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>
Sent: Tuesday, 15 September 2020 4:04 PM
To: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>
Subject: Re: Submission

Dear Professor Bates,

I look forward to meeting you.

Kind regards,
Helmy

From: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>
Date: Tuesday, September 15, 2020 at 4:02 PM
To: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>
Subject: RE: Submission

I will send you a google meeting link tomorrow afternoon shortly before 2.30

Rod Bates

From: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>
Sent: Tuesday, 15 September 2020 3:46 PM
To: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>
Subject: Re: Submission

Dear Professor Bates,

My gmail address is helmy.m@gmail.com

My Skype address is live:mmmhelmy_1

Kind regards,
Helmy

From: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>

Date: Tuesday, September 15, 2020 at 3:42 PM
To: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>
Subject: RE: Submission

Dear Dr Helmy

We can meet online. If you have a gmail address, I can set up a google meeting, otherwise, we can use skype. Let me know.

Rod Bates

From: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>
Sent: Tuesday, 15 September 2020 2:41 PM
To: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>
Subject: Re: Submission

Dear Professor Bates,

Thank you for your message, my apologies for the delay in reply.

I am eager to discuss my allegations with you.

I will be at your disposal 14.30 tomorrow (Wednesday). If earlier or later would suit you better, please let me know, I will be there.

I understand your office and laboratory is at the *School of Physical and Mathematical Sciences, Division of Chemistry and Biological Chemistry*, 21 Nanyang Link, 637371?

If I misunderstood and should be at the *President's Office, Administration Building*, 50 Nanyang Avenue, 639798, please let me know.

My phone number is 83 555 817.

I look forward to meeting you.

Kind regards,
Helmy



Mohamed Helmy, MD PhD
Research Fellow, School of Biological Sciences

50 Nanyang Avenue, School of Biological Sciences (SBS), Singapore 639798
T +65 83 555 817 mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg www.ntu.edu.sg



From: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>
Date: Tuesday, September 15, 2020 at 10:24 AM
To: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>

Subject: RE: Submission

Dear Dr Helmy

You have made a number of allegations in your e-mail. I would like to have a discussion with you to clarify your allegations concerning research integrity. Please let me know what times you are free tomorrow (Wednesday).

I believe that you will be contacted separately about the other matters.

Thanks

Roderick Bates
Associate Professor
Research Integrity Officer

From: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>

Sent: Friday, 11 September 2020 11:14 AM

To: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>; Roderick Wayland Bates (Assoc Prof) <Roderick@ntu.edu.sg>; Chief, Legal & Secretarial <D-LSO@ntu.edu.sg>; Joanna Foong Chi Yuen <JoannaFoong@ntu.edu.sg>; Adrian Chiew Choong Yee <adrian.chiew@ntu.edu.sg>; Esther Quek (OHR) <esther.quek@ntu.edu.sg>; #CHUA EILEEN# <EILEENCHUA@e.ntu.edu.sg>; Hayley Ng <hayley.ng@ntu.edu.sg>

Subject: Submission

To Human Resources, Legal and Secretarial Office, and Research Integrity and Ethics Office,

This concerns NTU Research Integrity Policy, Harassment Policy, and The University Code of Conduct. I would be very grateful for your urgent advice as I may become implicated in violations of NTU policy.

Please find a submission attached in two files (Main.pdf and Appendix.pdf).

Kind regards,
Mohamed Helmy



Mohamed Helmy, MD PhD
Research Fellow, School of Biological Sciences

50 Nanyang Avenue, School of Biological Sciences (SBS), Singapore 639798
T +65 83 555 817 mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg www.ntu.edu.sg



CONFIDENTIALITY: This email is intended solely for the person(s) named and may be confidential and/or privileged. If you are not the intended recipient, please delete it, notify us and do not copy, use, or disclose its contents.

Towards a sustainable earth: Print only when necessary. Thank you.

Subject: RE: Submission
Date: Tuesday, September 22, 2020 at 4:17:39 PM Singapore Standard Time
From: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>
To: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>, NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>, Chief, Legal & Secretarial <D-LSO@ntu.edu.sg>, Joanna Foong Chi Yuen <JoannaFoong@ntu.edu.sg>, Adrian Chiew Choong Yee <adrian.chiew@ntu.edu.sg>, Esther Quek (OHR) <esther.quek@ntu.edu.sg>, #CHUA EILEEN# <EILEENCHUA@e.ntu.edu.sg>
Attachments: image001.jpg, image017.jpg, image018.jpg, image019.jpg, image020.jpg, image021.jpg, image022.jpg, image023.jpg, image024.jpg, image025.jpg, image026.jpg, image027.jpg, image028.jpg, image029.jpg, image030.jpg

Thank you, Dr Helmy, your documents have been received and I will look through them.

Roderick Bates
Research Integrity Officer

From: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>
Sent: Monday, 21 September 2020 3:15 PM
To: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>; Roderick Wayland Bates (Assoc Prof) <Roderick@ntu.edu.sg>; Chief, Legal & Secretarial <D-LSO@ntu.edu.sg>; Joanna Foong Chi Yuen <JoannaFoong@ntu.edu.sg>; Adrian Chiew Choong Yee <adrian.chiew@ntu.edu.sg>; Esther Quek (OHR) <esther.quek@ntu.edu.sg>; #CHUA EILEEN# <EILEENCHUA@e.ntu.edu.sg>
Subject: Re: Submission

To Human Resources, Legal and Secretarial Office, and Research Integrity and Ethics Office,

On the request of the inquiry please find attached two files (*Main2.pdf* and *Appendix2.pdf*) clarifying on allegations of research misconduct in my submission.

Kind regards,
Mohamed Helmy



Mohamed Helmy, MD PhD
Research Fellow, School of Biological Sciences

50 Nanyang Avenue, School of Biological Sciences (SBS), Singapore 639798
T +65 83 555 817 mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg www.ntu.edu.sg



From: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>
Date: Friday, September 11, 2020 at 11:13 AM
To: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>, "Roderick Wayland Bates (Assoc Prof)" <Roderick@ntu.edu.sg>, "Chief, Legal & Secretarial" <D-LSO@ntu.edu.sg>, Joanna Foong Chi Yuen <JoannaFoong@ntu.edu.sg>, Adrian Chiew Choong Yee <adrian.chiew@ntu.edu.sg>, "Esther Quek (OHR)" <esther.quek@ntu.edu.sg>, #CHUA EILEEN# <EILEENCHUA@e.ntu.edu.sg>, Hayley Ng

<hayley.ng@ntu.edu.sg>

Subject: Submission

To Human Resources, Legal and Secretarial Office, and Research Integrity and Ethics Office,

This concerns NTU Research Integrity Policy, Harassment Policy, and The University Code of Conduct. I would be very grateful for your urgent advice as I may become implicated in violations of NTU policy.

Please find a submission attached in two files (Main.pdf and Appendix.pdf).

Kind regards,
Mohamed Helmy



Mohamed Helmy, MD PhD
Research Fellow, School of Biological Sciences

50 Nanyang Avenue, School of Biological Sciences (SBS), Singapore 639798
T +65 83 555 817 mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg www.ntu.edu.sg



CONFIDENTIALITY: This email is intended solely for the person(s) named and may be confidential and/or privileged. If you are not the intended recipient, please delete it, notify us and do not copy, use, or disclose its contents.

Towards a sustainable earth: Print only when necessary. Thank you.

Subject: RE: Submission
Date: Friday, October 2, 2020 at 12:09:57 PM Singapore Standard Time
From: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>
To: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>
Attachments: image001.jpg, image017.jpg, image018.jpg, image019.jpg, image020.jpg, image021.jpg, image022.jpg, image023.jpg, image024.jpg, image025.jpg, image026.jpg, image027.jpg, image028.jpg, image029.jpg, image030.jpg

Dear Dr Helmy

Please provide me with the date of the experiment that you refer to in section 3.1 of Appendix 2.

Thanks

Roderick Bates
Research Integrity Officer

From: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>
Sent: Monday, 21 September 2020 3:15 PM
To: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>; Roderick Wayland Bates (Assoc Prof) <Roderick@ntu.edu.sg>; Chief, Legal & Secretarial <D-LSO@ntu.edu.sg>; Joanna Foong Chi Yuen <JoannaFoong@ntu.edu.sg>; Adrian Chiew Choong Yee <adrian.chiew@ntu.edu.sg>; Esther Quek (OHR) <esther.quek@ntu.edu.sg>; #CHUA EILEEN# <EILEENCHUA@e.ntu.edu.sg>
Subject: Re: Submission

To Human Resources, Legal and Secretarial Office, and Research Integrity and Ethics Office,

On the request of the inquiry please find attached two files (*Main2.pdf* and *Appendix2.pdf*) clarifying on allegations of research misconduct in my submission.

Kind regards,
Mohamed Helmy



Mohamed Helmy, MD PhD
Research Fellow, School of Biological Sciences

50 Nanyang Avenue, School of Biological Sciences (SBS), Singapore 639798
T +65 83 555 817 mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg www.ntu.edu.sg



From: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>
Date: Friday, September 11, 2020 at 11:13 AM
To: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>, "Roderick Wayland Bates (Assoc Prof)" <Roderick@ntu.edu.sg>, "Chief, Legal & Secretarial" <D-LSO@ntu.edu.sg>, Joanna Foong Chi Yuen <JoannaFoong@ntu.edu.sg>, Adrian Chiew Choong Yee <adrian.chiew@ntu.edu.sg>, "Esther Quek (OHR)" <esther.quek@ntu.edu.sg>, #CHUA EILEEN# <EILEENCHUA@e.ntu.edu.sg>, Hayley Ng

<hayley.ng@ntu.edu.sg>

Subject: Submission

To Human Resources, Legal and Secretarial Office, and Research Integrity and Ethics Office,

This concerns NTU Research Integrity Policy, Harassment Policy, and The University Code of Conduct. I would be very grateful for your urgent advice as I may become implicated in violations of NTU policy.

Please find a submission attached in two files (Main.pdf and Appendix.pdf).

Kind regards,
Mohamed Helmy



Mohamed Helmy, MD PhD
Research Fellow, School of Biological Sciences

50 Nanyang Avenue, School of Biological Sciences (SBS), Singapore 639798
T +65 83 555 817 mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg www.ntu.edu.sg



CONFIDENTIALITY: This email is intended solely for the person(s) named and may be confidential and/or privileged. If you are not the intended recipient, please delete it, notify us and do not copy, use, or disclose its contents.

Towards a sustainable earth: Print only when necessary. Thank you.

Subject: Re: Submission
Date: Sunday, October 4, 2020 at 1:21:45 PM Singapore Standard Time
From: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>
To: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>
Attachments: image001.jpg, image002.jpg, image003.jpg, image004.jpg, image005.jpg, image006.jpg, image007.jpg, image008.jpg, image009.jpg, image010.jpg, image011.jpg, image012.jpg, image013.jpg, image014.jpg, image015.jpg, image016.jpg, image017.jpg, image018.jpg, image019.jpg, image020.jpg, image021.jpg, image022.jpg, image023.jpg

Thank you, Dr Helmy. Just telling me the date would have been sufficient.

Roderick Bates
RIO

From: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>
Sent: Saturday, 3 October 2020 8:06 AM
To: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>
Subject: Re: Submission

Dear Professor Bates,

Regarding the terminal sample collection, trunk blood from aged transgenic mice:

1. The date of the experiments was Friday 11th September, 2020 (first Appendix, page 60).
2. The location of experiments was LKC ARF, a procedure room was booked by the Research Assistant.
3. I took annual leave on Thursday 10th and Friday 11th September so as not to take part in these procedures (Appendix 2, pages 21 and 24).
4. I had been informed of these experiments by the Research Assistant (first Appendix, page 60). I was later updated through the Research Assistant that my schedule had been modified thrice but this terminal sample collection remained unchanged (first Appendix, pages 53, 54, 60, 61, and 62). The final schedule is in the screenshot in the first Appendix, page 53, received from the Research Assistant on Wednesday 9th September in a WhatsApp message.
5. With RM's Research Assistant, I had taken part in behavioral experiments (home cage emergence, elevated plus maze, and light-dark box) on some of these animals or a different cohort of similar animals on Tuesday 8th September at LKC ARF PR-SPF 4. These behavioral experiments had been planned for earlier but I was informed they had been postponed for unknown reasons. On being informed of my role to assist in these experiments, I refused to take part until I saw the relevant IACUC approval for myself which the Research Assistant finally consented to on Monday 31st August, AUP: A19027. I found out animals for these experiments are transgenic on Tuesday 8th September and did not receive a comprehensive reply on-site from RM's Research Assistant on how and why this is the case. Also during these procedures at LKC ARF, RM's Research Assistant was casually informed by GA's Research Assistant that RM had just instructed her (GA's Research Assistant) to quickly organize an additional cohort of animals for experiments by RM's Research Assistant (and presumably myself). RM's Research Assistant later informed me that we would be doing the same procedures on this following cohort.
6. I have WhatsApp messages from RM's Research Assistant to the effect that experiments on Friday 11th September proceeded as planned, furnished upon request.

Kind regards,
Mohamed Helmy



Mohamed Helmy, MD PhD
Research Fellow, School of Biological Sciences

50 Nanyang Avenue, School of Biological Sciences (SBS), Singapore 639798
T +65 83 555 817 mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg www.ntu.edu.sg



From: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>
Date: Friday, October 2, 2020 at 12:10 PM
To: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>
Subject: RE: Submission

Dear Dr Helmy

Please provide me with the date of the experiment that you refer to in section 3.1 of Appendix 2.

Thanks

Roderick Bates
Research Integrity Officer

From: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>
Sent: Monday, 21 September 2020 3:15 PM
To: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>; Roderick Wayland Bates (Assoc Prof) <Roderick@ntu.edu.sg>; Chief, Legal & Secretarial <D-LSO@ntu.edu.sg>; Joanna Foong Chi Yuen <JoannaFoong@ntu.edu.sg>; Adrian Chiew Choong Yee <adrian.chiew@ntu.edu.sg>; Esther Quek (OHR) <esther.quek@ntu.edu.sg>; #CHUA EILEEN# <EILEENCHUA@e.ntu.edu.sg>
Subject: Re: Submission

To Human Resources, Legal and Secretarial Office, and Research Integrity and Ethics Office,

On the request of the inquiry please find attached two files (*Main2.pdf* and *Appendix2.pdf*) clarifying on allegations of research misconduct in my submission.

Kind regards,
Mohamed Helmy



Mohamed Helmy, MD PhD
Research Fellow, School of Biological Sciences

50 Nanyang Avenue, School of Biological Sciences (SBS), Singapore 639798
T +65 83 555 817 mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg www.ntu.edu.sg



From: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>
Date: Friday, September 11, 2020 at 11:13 AM
To: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>, "Roderick Wayland Bates (Assoc Prof)" <Roderick@ntu.edu.sg>, "Chief, Legal & Secretarial" <D-LSO@ntu.edu.sg>, Joanna Foong Chi Yuen <JoannaFoong@ntu.edu.sg>, Adrian Chiew Choong Yee <adrian.chiew@ntu.edu.sg>, "Esther Quek (OHR)" <esther.quek@ntu.edu.sg>, #CHUA EILEEN# <EILEENCHUA@e.ntu.edu.sg>, Hayley Ng <hayley.ng@ntu.edu.sg>
Subject: Submission

To Human Resources, Legal and Secretarial Office, and Research Integrity and Ethics Office,

This concerns NTU Research Integrity Policy, Harassment Policy, and The University Code of Conduct. I would be very grateful for your urgent advice as I may become implicated in violations of NTU policy.

Please find a submission attached in two files (Main.pdf and Appendix.pdf).

Kind regards,
Mohamed Helmy



Mohamed Helmy, MD PhD
Research Fellow, School of Biological Sciences

50 Nanyang Avenue, School of Biological Sciences (SBS), Singapore 639798
T +65 83 555 817 mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg www.ntu.edu.sg



CONFIDENTIALITY: This email is intended solely for the person(s) named and may be confidential and/or privileged. If you are not the intended recipient, please delete it, notify us and do not copy, use, or disclose its contents.

Towards a sustainable earth: Print only when necessary. Thank you.

Subject: Allegations

Date: Wednesday, October 7, 2020 at 9:07:35 AM Singapore Standard Time

From: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>

To: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>

Dear Dr Helmy

To the best of your knowledge, is Asst Prof Mitra aware that you have made formal complaints about her? I need to hear her response to your allegations about Research Integrity. While I will not divulge your name, I imagine that it will not take her long to deduce it.

Roderick Bates
Research Integrity Officer

Subject: RE: T3 meeting

Date: Thursday, October 8, 2020 at 9:53:07 AM Singapore Standard Time

From: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>

To: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>

I don't plan to contact Asst Prof Mitra until after Friday.

RB

From: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>

Sent: Wednesday, 7 October 2020 11:51 AM

To: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>

Subject: T3 meeting

Dear Professor Bates,

To the best of my knowledge Asst Prof Mitra is aware of my complaint.

I am attending the *MOE Tier 3 Dementia Research* meeting on Friday 9th October. If asked about research and experiments for the *Dementia Research* project, or work progress during the time I was tasked by Asst Prof Mitra in the *Neurobiology of Stress* project, what do I reply?

Kind regards,
Mohamed Helmy

From: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>

Date: Wednesday, October 7, 2020 at 9:07 AM

To: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>

Subject: Allegations

Dear Dr Helmy

To the best of your knowledge, is Asst Prof Mitra aware that you have made formal complaints about her? I need to hear her response to your allegations about Research Integrity. While I will not divulge your name, I imagine that it will not take her long to deduce it.

Roderick Bates
Research Integrity Officer

CONFIDENTIALITY: This email is intended solely for the person(s) named and may be confidential and/or privileged. If you are not the intended recipient, please delete it, notify us and do not copy, use, or disclose its contents.

Towards a sustainable earth: Print only when necessary. Thank you.

Subject: Your allegations of research misconduct

Date: Friday, November 13, 2020 at 10:33:47 AM Singapore Standard Time

From: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>

To: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>

Dear Dr Helmy

The extensive documents that you have submitted have been reviewed. The content is largely concerned with your disagreements with research techniques used in the Mitra lab. There is a proper way to resolve these (and other workers disagreements with your techniques). This is by dialogue. It seems that such dialogue is no longer possible which is to be regretted.

A small part of the submitted documents actually concerns issues of research integrity. You made some allegations about reuse of data in multiple papers. This has been rebutted and I am satisfied with the rebuttal.

You made an insinuation about the editorial practices of the journal *Frontiers in Behavioral Neuroscience*. Frankly, the insinuation that you made is nonsensical and utterly lacks any basis.

The most serious allegation that you made concerns the mouse experiment which you did not participate in as you took an MC that day to cover your absence. Your allegations have been reviewed by two experts and have been found to be without merit.

In summary, I have not found any issues of research integrity in your submission. I believe that OHR and LSO will be contacting you separately.

Roderick Bates
Research Integrity Officer

Subject: Re: Your reply on allegations of research misconduct
Date: Wednesday, December 2, 2020 at 2:06:53 PM Singapore Standard Time
From: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>
To: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>

Dear Dr Helmy

Please forgive a delayed reply, but I have been marking exams.

I had a meeting with Prof Mitra, just as I met with you, and she was able to provide assurances about the issues in question. Similarly, the IACUC experts gave me very clear assurances. As for the MC, I recall that you took a day off sick on the occasion of the mouse experiment, so I assumed that you had submitted an MC as required by NTU policy. Sorry about that.

I have also looked through your latest document *Main5*. You allege *inter alia* breaches of animal ethics, research misconduct including falsification in publications and plagiarism in both doctoral thesis and FYP reports. In none of these cases do you provide any actual evidence or any specific instance of misconduct. As such, I will not be investigating further as I cannot consider your submission to be a serious allegation.

yours sincerely

Roderick Bates
Research Integrity Officer

From: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>
Sent: Thursday, 26 November 2020 11:20 AM
To: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>
Subject: Your reply on allegations of research misconduct

Dear Professor Bates,

I reported research misconduct at NTU in part because my repeated requests to be informed and for dialogue were dismissed. Correspondence submitted shows my frequent requests for meetings to discuss research *objective* were delayed or ignored, and I was finally informed it is none of my concern. As to my one query on a research *technique*, that was also none of my concern.

I am unaware of other workers disagreements.

A small part of submitted documents actually concerns article duplication. The majority is on suspected misrepresentation, falsification, fabrication, and unethical animal experiment practice and reporting thereof.

I do not suppose a journal's editorial practice is subject to Singapore's legislation and NTU policy. Compliance with publisher guidelines was not mentioned among the extensive documents I had

submitted.

To confirm, 'MC' is 'medical certificate'? If so, I never took an MC.

I am puzzled how to align my submission with your message. May I see the rebuttal, expert review, and findings within the *Framework for Investigation and Disciplinary Proceedings*, or redacted copies thereof?

Kind regards,
Helmy

From: NTU Research Integrity Officer <NTURIO@ntu.edu.sg>
Date: Friday, November 13, 2020 at 10:33 AM
To: Mohamed Mustafa Mahmoud Helmy <mohd.mustafa@ntu.edu.sg>
Subject: Your allegations of research misconduct

Dear Dr Helmy

The extensive documents that you have submitted have been reviewed. The content is largely concerned with your disagreements with research techniques used in the Mitra lab. There is a proper way to resolve these (and other workers disagreements with your techniques). This is by dialogue. It seems that such dialogue is no longer possible which is to be regretted.

A small part of the submitted documents actually concerns issues of research integrity. You made some allegations about reuse of data in multiple papers. This has been rebutted and I am satisfied with the rebuttal.

You made an insinuation about the editorial practices of the journal *Frontiers in Behavioral Neuroscience*. Frankly, the insinuation that you made is nonsensical and utterly lacks any basis.

The most serious allegation that you made concerns the mouse experiment which you did not participate in as you took an MC that day to cover your absence. Your allegations have been reviewed by two experts and have been found to be without merit.

In summary, I have not found any issues of research integrity in your submission. I believe that OHR and LSO will be contacting you separately.

Roderick Bates
Research Integrity Officer

CONFIDENTIALITY: This email is intended solely for the person(s) named and may be confidential and/or privileged. If you are not the intended recipient, please delete it, notify us and do not copy, use, or disclose its contents.

Towards a sustainable earth: Print only when necessary. Thank you.