

Mohamed Helmy <helmy.m@gmail.com>

## CMS-000001586 - Additional Information Required

5 messages

UNSW Research Integrity <research.integrity@unsw.edu.au>
To: "helmy.m@gmail.com" <helmy.m@gmail.com>, PVC Track In Insight CRM <trackincrm@unsw.edu.au>

Cc: UNSW Research Integrity <research.integrity@unsw.edu.au>

## STRICTLY CONFIDENTIAL

Dear Dr Helmy,

Re: UNSW Actions regarding your Complaint of 18 January 2021 Our Ref: CMS-000001586

I am writing to you regarding UNSW's consideration of your complaint of 18 January 2021. I advise that an Interim Initial Assessment has been completed and the Designated Officer has dete

It is important to note that your complaint is being considered under the UNSW Research Misconduct Procedure, which applies to Research undertaken by UNSW Researchers. The Designa

Below are 2 tables that include items which have been identified as relating to Research conducted (or published) by UNSW Researchers.

We request that you to review these tables and confirm the following.

- 1) Whether they are the only items from your complaint that relate to Research conducted (or published) by a Researcher at UNSW.
- 2) The specific nature of your concerns in relation to each Table Item in both Tables 1 and 2, particularly in relation to the queries listed in red text. The columns titled 'complaint type' and 'co Once we have received your clarification, the Designated Officer will review the information and you will be notified of the outcome of the Initial Assessment.

TABLE 1: Publications of concern with UNSW affiliation listed

Table Item	UNSW Authors	Corresponding Author	Complaint Type
1	Russell Chander (4th author) - Scientia PhD Candidate/ Research Assistant (UNSW)	Nagaendran Kandiah (Department of Neurology, National Neuroscience Institute; Duke- NUS Medical School; Lee Kong Chian School of Medicine, Singapore, Singapore)	Misleading content/ conlcusions in publication     duplicate publication
2	Russell Chander (4th author) - Scientia PhD Candidate/ Research Assistant (UNSW)	Nagaendran Kandiah (Department of Neurology, National Neuroscience Institute; Duke- NUS Medical School; Lee Kong Chian School of Medicine, Singapore, Singapore)	Misleading content/ confcusions in publication     duplicate publication     not clear

4/27/23	, 7:40	AM Gmail - CMS-0000	001586 - Additiona	al Information Required
	3	Heidi Foo (4th author) - PhD Candidate (UNSW)	Nagaendran Kandiah (Department of Neurology, National Neuroscience Institute; Duke- NUS Medical School; Lee Kong Chian School of Medicine, Singapore, Singapore)	"putatively duplicated work 2018-2020"
	4	Russell Jude Chander (3rd author) - Scientia PhD Candidate/ Research Assistant (UNS	W) Nagaendran Kandiah (Department of Neurology, National Neuroscience Institute; Duke- NUS Medical School; Lee Kong Chian School of Medicine, Singapore, Singapore)	Misleading content/ conlcusions in publication     duplicate publication (unclear which publications you suggest Low et al 2)

Russell Jude Chander (5th Author) - Scientia PhD Candidate/ Research Assistant (UNSW)

1. Jessica Lo 2. John D Crawford 3. Russell J Chander 4. Henry Brodaty 5. Darren M Lipnicki

6. Nicole A. Kochan 7. Perminder Sachdev

1. Jessica Lo
2. John D Crawford
3. Russell J Chander
4. Darren M Lipnicki
5. Perminder Sachdev

6. Katherine Samaras

Nagaendran

Kandiah

1. Misleading content/ conclusions in publication

Table Item	Paper published by STROKOG
1	Lo, Jessica W., John D. Crawford, David W. Desmond, Olivier Godefroy, Hanna Jokinen, Simin Mahinrad, Hee-Joon Bae et al. "Profile of and risk factors for poststroke cognitiv
2	Lo, Jessica W; Crawford, John D; Samaras, Katherine; Desmond, David W; Köhler, Sebastian; Kim, Beom Joon; Bordet, Régis; Cordonnier, Charlotte; Dondaine, Thibaut; Men
3	Tang, Eugene YH, Christopher I. Price, Louise Robinson, Catherine Exley, David W. Desmond, Sebastian Köhler, Julie Staals et al. "Assessing the Predictive Validity of Simple
4	Sachdev, Perminder S., Jessica W. Lo, John D. Crawford, Lisa Mellon, Anne Hickey, David Williams, Régis Bordet et al. "STROKOG (stroke and cognition consortium): An inte

If you have any questions, please don't hesitate to contact me.

# Amelia Kowalski

Team Leader - Research Integrity, Conduct & Integrity Office

UNSW SYDNEY NSW 2052 AUSTRALIA

E: research.integrity@unsw.edu.au

T: +61 2 9385 3553

W: http://research.unsw.edu.au

Explore: Research Integrity at UNSW









CRICOS Provider Code 00098G

This email (including any attached files) is intended only for the addressee, it may contain confidential information. If you are not the addressee, you are notified that any transmission, distribution, printing or

### IMPORTANT! Please ensure that you "reply all"to this email and do not alter the subject line when responding. If these instructions are not i

UNSW Research Integrity <research.integrity@unsw.edu.au> To: "helmy.m@gmail.com" <helmy.m@gmail.com>, PVC Track In Insight CRM <trackincrm@unsw.edu.au> Cc: UNSW Research Integrity <research.integrity@unsw.edu.au>

16 March 2021 at 00:18

## STRICTLY CONFIDENTIAL

Dear Dr Helmy,

I am writing to you in relation to the below correspondence regarding your complaint of 18 January 2021.

In the email dated 1 March 2021, Research Integrity requested you to review the information and confirm some details relating to you complaint.

Could you please provide these details by 29 March 2021.

Thank you.

#### **Dimitrios Pandioras**

Case Manager

Conduct & Integrity Office

Division of Equity Diversity & Inclusion

**UNSW SYDNEY 2052** 

E: research.integrity@unsw.edu.au

W: http://research.unsw.edu.au

T: +61 2 9065 7255











CRICOS Provider Code 00098G

UNSW is located on the unceded territory of the Bedegal (Kensington campus) Gadigal (City and Paddington Campuses) and Ngunnawal peoples (UNSW Canberra) who are the Traditional Owners of the lands where each campus of UNSW is situated

[Quoted text hidden]

[Quoted text hidden]

Mohamed Helmy <a href="helmy.m@gmail.com">helmy.m@gmail.com</a>
To: UNSW Research Integrity <a href="research.integrity@unsw.edu.au">research.integrity@unsw.edu.au</a>
Co: PVC Track In Insight CRM <a href="helm:research.integrity@unsw.edu.au">research.integrity@unsw.edu.au</a>

Dear Amelia and Dimitrios,

My sincere apologies for the delay in replying. The efforts to silence me in Singapore are vicious and I spend an inordinate amount of time defending myself.

I am reassured by your comprehensive and thorough address of the complaint. Thank you for returning to me confidence that there is such a thing as due process.

I address the points raised, below in-line in blue text with reference to notes below the tables:

1) Whether they are the only items from your complaint that relate to Research conducted (or published) by a Researcher at UNSW. Yes, these are the only items from my complaint related to Research conducted (or published) by a Researcher at UNSW

2) The specific nature of your concerns in relation to each Table Item in both Tables 1 and 2, particularly in relation to the queries listed in red text. The columns titled 'complaint type' and 'com

TABLE 1: Publications of concern with UNSW affiliation listed

Table Item	UNSW Authors	Corresponding Author	Complaint Type
1	Russell Chander (4th author) - Scientia PhD Candidate/ Research Assistant (UNSW)	Nagaendran Kandiah (Department of Neurology, National Neuroscience Institute; Duke- NUS Medical School; Lee Kong Chian School of Medicine, Singapore, Singapore)	Misleading content/ confcusions in publication Confirmed*      duplicate publication Confirmed*
2	1. Russell Chander (4th author) - Scientia PhD Candidate/ Research Assistant (UNSW)	Nagaendran Kandiah (Department of Neurology, National Neuroscience Institute; Duke- NUS Medical School; Lee Kong Chian School of Medicine, Singapore, Singapore)	1. Misleading content/ conlcusions in publication Confirmed* 2. duplicate publication Confirmed* 3. not clear Misrepresenting and putatively falsifying research data   **The confirmed***  **The confirmed**  **The confirme

4/27/23,	, 7:40	AM Gmail - CMS-000001	586 - Additiona	l Information Required
	3	Heidi Foo (4th author) - PhD Candidate (UNSW)	Nagaendran Kandiah (Department of Neurology, National Neuroscience Institute; Duke- NUS Medical School; Lee Kong Chian School of Medicine, Singapore, Singapore)	"putatively duplicated work 2018-2020" Confirmed*
	4	Russell Jude Chander (3rd author) - Scientia PhD Candidate/ Research Assistant (UNSW)	Nagaendran Kandiah (Department of Neurology, National Neuroscience Institute; Duke- NUS Medical School; Lee Kong Chian School of Medicine, Singapore, Singapore,	Misleading content/ confcusions in publication Confirmed*     duplicate publication (unclear which publications you suggest Low et al 20 Please see§
	5	1. Jessica Lo 2. John D Crawford 3. Russell J Chander 4. Henry Brodaty 5. Darren M Lipnicki	Perminder Sachdev (UNSW)	Unclear - possibly ethics again and possibly that Kandiah should not qualify

	6. Nicole A. Kochan 7. Perminder Sachdev		
6	1. Jessica Lo 2. John D Crawford 3. Russell J Chander 4. Darren M Lipnicki 5. Perminder Sachdev 6. Katherine Samaras	Jessica Lo (UNSW)	Ethics Approval – please clarify if the concern is that participant consent shou
7	Russell Jude Chander (5th Author) - Scientia PhD Candidate/ Research Assistant (UNSW)	Nagaendran Kandiah (Department of Neurology, National Neuroscience Institute; Duke- NUS Medical School; Lee Kong Chian School of Medicine, Singapore, Singapore)	Misleading content/ conclusions in publication Confirmed*     duplicate publication (unclear which publications you suggest Guevarra et a

/27/23, 7:40 AM	Gmail - CMS-000001586 - Additional Information Required	

Table Item	Paper published by STROKOG
1	Lo, Jessica W., John D. Crawford, David W. Desmond, Olivier Godefroy, Hanna Jokinen, Simin Mahinrad, Hee-Joon Bae et al. "Profile of and risk factors for poststroke cognitive
2	Lo, Jessica W; Crawford, John D; Samaras, Katherine; Desmond, David W; Köhler, Sebastian; Kim, Beom Joon; Bordet, Régis; Cordonnier, Charlotte; Dondaine, Thibaut; Men
3	Tang, Eugene YH, Christopher I. Price, Louise Robinson, Catherine Exley, David W. Desmond, Sebastian Köhler, Julie Staals et al. "Assessing the Predictive Validity of Simple
4	Sachdev, Perminder S., Jessica W. Lo, John D. Crawford, Lisa Mellon, Anne Hickey, David Williams, Régis Bordet et al. "STROKOG (stroke and cognition consortium): An inte

# **Notes**

## \* Misleading content or conclusions in publication

I agree these points are correctly identified.

‡ Misrepresentation and putative falsification in Yatawara et al. 2020a
My apologies for not clarifying sufficiently in the report. In Yatawara et al. 2020a, it is stated that "...Microbleed etiologies of interest involved micro-bleeds which were CAA-related, defined usi

§ Putative duplicate results in Low et al. 2019b These are: (i) Low et al. 2019c; (ii) Chander et al. 2018; and (iii) Foo et al. 2018.

have no doubt that Lo and Sachdev are not engaged in misconduct by Kandiah and others in Singapore contributing to STROKOG work. Indeed, had it not been for the accurate reporting as Worryingly, another UNSW and STROKOG collaborator in Singapore, Christopher Chen, is implicated in evidence I compiled and did not share. This evidence is placed in the context of ageir

# † Putative duplicate results in Guevarra et al. 2020

At least Kumar et al. 2020. In my opinion, work by Kandiah which may be duplicated with Guevarra et al. 2020 may also include studies putatively utilizing the Singapore Young Onset Demen

## Framework

The work by UNSW Authors in question was done in Singapore and elsewhere. As the complaint is investigated under UNSW Research Misconduct Procedure, I believe it is most conducive is Review Boards 'guidelines', or more accurately, recommendations; (iii) this is the framework in which the complaint is being investigated and to be complied with by UNSW Authors according

# **UNSW-Singapore collaboration and exchange**

From my experience and in my opinion, I may write that implementation by UNSW of its Research Code of Conduct is, thus far, enviable. Clearly, UNSW students and researchers may not experience. authorities to make a commitment towards enforcing law and policy regulating research in autonomous institutes such as Nanyang Technological University.

Once again, I apologize for the delay in my reply. Please do not hesitate to contact me, and I may meet with you online should this facilitate the investigation.

Kind regards Mohamed Helmy MD, PhD

helmy.m@gmail.com helmv.m@protonmail.com +65 83 555 817 10 Jurong Lake Link, #15-39 Singapore 648131

On Tue, 16 Mar 2021 at 07:18, UNSW Research Integrity <research.integrity@unsw.edu.au> wrote:

#### STRICTLY CONFIDENTIAL

Dear Dr Helmy,

I am writing to you in relation to the below correspondence regarding your complaint of 18 January 2021.

In the email dated 1 March 2021, Research Integrity requested you to review the information and confirm some details relating to you complaint.

Could you please provide these details by 29 March 2021.

Thank you.

#### **Dimitrios Pandioras**

Case Manager

Conduct & Integrity Office

Division of Equity Diversity & Inclusion

UNSW SYDNEY 2052

E: research.integrity@unsw.edu.au

W: http://research.unsw.edu.au

T: +61 2 9065 7255







CRICOS Provider Code 00098G

UNSW is located on the unceded territory of the Bedegal (Kensington campus), Gadigal (City and Paddington Campuses) and Ngunnawal peoples (UNSW Canberra) who are the Traditional Owners of the lands where each campus of UNSW is situated.

This email (including any attached files) is intended only for the addressee, it may contain confidential information. If you are not the addressee, you are notified that any transmission, distribution, printing or duplication of th

### IMPORTANT! Please ensure that you "reply all" to this email and do not alter the subject line when responding. If these instructions are not followed your reply may not be received ###

From: UNSW Research Integrity <research.integrity@unsw.edu.au>

Sent: Monday, 1 March 2021 4:15 PM

To: helmy.m@gmail.com; PVC Track In Insight CRM <trackincrm@unsw.edu.au>

Cc: UNSW Research Integrity <research.integrity@unsw.edu.au> Subject: CMS-000001586 - Additional Information Required

## STRICTLY CONFIDENTIAL

Dear Dr Helmy,

Re: UNSW Actions regarding your Complaint of 18 January 2021 Our Ref: CMS-000001586

I am writing to you regarding UNSW's consideration of your complaint of 18 January 2021. I advise that an Interim Initial Assessment has been completed and the Designated Officer has do

It is important to note that your complaint is being considered under the UNSW Research Misconduct Procedure, which applies to Research undertaken by UNSW Researchers. The Desig

Below are 2 tables that include items which have been identified as relating to Research conducted (or published) by UNSW Researchers.

We request that you to review these tables and confirm the following.

- 1) Whether they are the only items from your complaint that relate to Research conducted (or published) by a Researcher at UNSW.
- 2) The specific nature of your concerns in relation to each Table Item in both Tables 1 and 2, particularly in relation to the queries listed in red text. The columns titled 'complaint type' and 'co Once we have received your clarification, the Designated Officer will review the information and you will be notified of the outcome of the Initial Assessment.

TABLE 1: Publications of concern with UNSW affiliation listed

Table Item	UNSW Authors  Russell Chander (4th author) - Scientia PhD Candidate/ Research Assistant (UNSW)	Corresponding Author  Nagaendran Kandiah (Department of Neurology, National Neuroscience Institute; Duke- NUS Medical School; Lee Kong Chian School of Medicine, Singapore, Singapore)	Complaint Type  1. Misleading content/ conlcusions in publication 2. duplicate publication
2	Russell Chander (4th author) - Scientia PhD Candidate/ Research Assistant (UNSW)	Nagaendran Kandiah (Department of Neurology, National Neuroscience Institute; Duke- NUS Medical School; Lee Kong Chian School of Medicine, Singapore, Singapore)	1. Misleading content/ conlcusions in publication 2. duplicate publication 3. not clear

4/27	7/23, 7	7:40 AN	M Gmail - CMS-00000158	6 - Additional I	nformation Required
		3	Heidi Foo (4th author) - PhD Candidate (UNSW)	Nagaendran Kandiah (Department of Neurology, National Neuroscience Institute; Duke- NUS Medical School; Lee Kong Chian School of Medicine, Singapore, Singapore)	"putatively duplicated work 2018-2020"
		4	Russell Jude Chander (3rd author) - Scientia PhD Candidate/ Research Assistant (UNSW)	Nagaendran Kandiah (Department of Neurology, National Neuroscience Institute; Duke- NUS Medical School; Lee Kong Chian School of Medicine, Singapore, Singapore)	Misleading content/ conlcusions in publication     duplicate publication (unclear which publications you suggest Low et a supplication of the
		5	1. Jessica Lo 2. John D Crawford 3. Russell J Chander 4. Henry Brodaty 5. Darren M Lipnicki	Perminder Sachdev (UNSW)	Unclear - possibly ethics again and possibly that Kandiah should not qua

	6. Nicole A. Kochan 7. Perminder Sachdev		
6	1. Jessica Lo 2. John D Crawford 3. Russell J Chander 4. Darren M Lipnicki 5. Perminder Sachdev 6. Katherine Samaras	Jessica Lo (UNSW)	Ethics Approval – please clarify if the concern is that participant consent sh
7	Russell Jude Chander (5th Author) - Scientia PhD Candidate/ Research Assistant (UNSW)	Nagaendran Kandiah (Department of Neurology, National Neuroscience Institute; Duke- NUS Medical School; Lee Kong Chian School of Medicine, Singapore, Singapore)	Misleading content/ conclusions in publication     duplicate publication (unclear which publications you suggest Guevarra suggest)

Jessica W., John D. Crawford, David W. Desmond, Olivier Godefroy, Hanna Jokinen, Simin Mahinrad, Hee-Joon Bae et al. "Profile of and risk factors for poststroke cogn
Jessica W; Crawford, John D; Samaras, Katherine; Desmond, David W; Köhler, Sebastian; Kim, Beom Joon; Bordet, Régis; Cordonnier, Charlotte; Dondaine, Thibaut; M
ng, Eugene YH, Christopher I. Price, Louise Robinson, Catherine Exley, David W. Desmond, Sebastian Köhler, Julie Staals et al. "Assessing the Predictive Validity of Simp
chdev, Perminder S., Jessica W. Lo, John D. Crawford, Lisa Mellon, Anne Hickey, David Williams, Régis Bordet et al. "STROKOG (stroke and cognition consortium): An in
ng,

If you have any questions, please don't hesitate to contact me.

# Amelia Kowalski

4/27/23, 7:40 AM

Team Leader - Research Integrity, Conduct & Integrity Office

UNSW SYDNEY NSW 2052 AUSTRALIA

E: research.integrity@unsw.edu.au

T: +61 2 9385 3553

W: http://research.unsw.edu.au

Explore: Research Integrity at UNSW









CRICOS Provider Code 00098G

This email (including any attached files) is intended only for the addressee, it may contain confidential information. If you are not the addressee, you are notified that any transmission, distribution, printing

### IMPORTANT! Please ensure that you "reply all"to this email and do not alter the subject line when responding. If these instructions are no

UNSW Research Integrity research.integrity@unsw.edu.au>
To: Mohamed Helmy helmy.m@gmail.com>, PVC Track In Insight CRM trackincrm@unsw.edu.au>

Cc: UNSW Research Integrity <research integrity@unsw.edu.au>

#### STRICTLY CONFIDENTIAL

Dear Dr Helmy,

Thank you for providing the requested information.

We will assess the information and provide you with an update as the Initial Assessment progresses.

Thank you.

#### **Dimitrios Pandioras**

Case Manager

Conduct & Integrity Office

Division of Equity Diversity & Inclusion

UNSW SYDNEY 2052

E: research.integrity@unsw.edu.au

W: http://research.unsw.edu.au

T: +61 2 9065 7255









\*See unsw.to/reputation



CRICOS Provider Code 00098G

UNSW is located on the unceded territory of the Bedegal (Kensington campus) Gadigal (City and Paddington Campuses) and Ngunnawal peoples (UNSW Canberra) who are the Traditional Owners of the lands where each campus of UNSW is situated

This email (including any attached files) is intended only for the addressee, it may contain confidential information. If you are not the addressee, you are notified that any transmission, distribution, printing or duplication of this

### IMPORTANT! Please ensure that you "reply all" to this email and do not alter the subject line when responding. If these instructions are not followed your reply may not be received ###

From: Mohamed Helmy <helmy.m@gmail.com>

Sent: Tuesday, 23 March 2021 5:43 PM

To: UNSW Research Integrity <research.integrity@unsw.edu.au> Cc: PVC Track In Insight CRM <trackincrm@unsw.edu.au> Subject: Re: CMS-000001586 - Additional Information Required

Dear Amelia and Dimitrios,

My sincere apologies for the delay in replying. The efforts to silence me in Singapore are vicious and I spend an inordinate amount of time defending myself.

I am reassured by your comprehensive and thorough address of the complaint. Thank you for returning to me confidence that there is such a thing as due process.

I address the points raised, below in-line in blue text with reference to notes below the tables:

1) Whether they are the only items from your complaint that relate to Research conducted (or published) by a Researcher at UNSW.

Yes, these are the only items from my complaint related to Research conducted (or published) by a Researcher at UNSW.

2) The specific nature of your concerns in relation to each Table Item in both Tables 1 and 2, particularly in relation to the queries listed in red text. The columns titled 'complaint type' and 'com Please see below for clarifications.

TABLE 1: Publications of concern with UNSW affiliation listed

Table Item	UNSW Authors	Corresponding Author	Complaint Type
1	Russell Chander (4th author) - Scientia PhD Candidate/ Research Assistant (UNSW)	Nagaendran Kandiah (Department of Neurology, National Neuroscience Institute; Duke- NUS Medical School; Lee Kong Chian School of Medicine, Singapore, Singapore,	1. Misleading content/ conlcusions in publication Confirmed*  2. duplicate publication Confirmed*
2	Russell Chander (4th author) - Scientia PhD Candidate/ Research Assistant (UNSW)	Nagaendran Kandiah (Department of Neurology, National Neuroscience Institute; Duke- NUS Medical School; Lee Kong Chian School of Medicine, Singapore, Singapore)	1. Misleading content/ conlcusions in publication Confirmed* 2. duplicate publication Confirmed* 3. not clear Misrepresenting and putatively falsifying research data;

4/27/23	, 7:40	AM Gmail - CMS-000001	586 - Additiona	l Information Required
	3	Heidi Foo (4th author) - PhD Candidate (UNSW)	Nagaendran Kandiah (Department of Neurology, National Neuroscience Institute; Duke- NUS Medical School; Lee Kong Chian School of Medicine, Singapore, Singapore)	"putatively duplicated work 2018-2020" Confirmed*
	4	Russell Jude Chander (3rd author) - Scientia PhD Candidate/ Research Assistant (UNSW)	Nagaendran Kandiah (Department of Neurology, National Neuroscience Institute; Duke- NUS Medical School; Lee Kong Chian School of Medicine, Singapore, Singapore)	Misleading content/ confcusions in publication Confirmed*     duplicate publication (unclear which publications you suggest Low et al 2 Please see§

0	1. Jessica Lo 2. John D Crawford 3. Russell J Chander 4. Henry Brodaty 5. Darren M Lipnicki 6. Nicole A. Kochan 7. Perminder Sachdev	Perminder Sachdev (UNSW)	Unclear - possibly ethics again and possibly that Kandiah should not qualify a
6	1. Jessica Lo 2. John D Crawford 3. Russell J Chander 4. Darren M Lipnicki 5. Perminder Sachdev 6. Katherine Samaras	Jessica Lo (UNSW)	Ethics Approval – please clarify if the concern is that participant consent should be a clarify if the concern is that participant consent should be a clarify if the concern is that participant consent should be a clarify if the concern is that participant consent should be a clarify if the concern is that participant consent should be a clarify if the concern is that participant consent should be a clarify if the concern is that participant consent should be a clarify if the concern is that participant consent should be a clarify if the concern is that participant consent should be a clarify if the concern is that participant consent should be a clarify if the concern is that participant consent should be a clarify if the concern is that participant consent should be a clarify if the concern is that participant consent should be a clarify if the concern is that participant consent should be a clarify if the concern is the
7	Russell Jude Chander (5th Author) - Scientia PhD Candidate/ Research Assistant (UNSW)	Nagaendran Kandiah (Department of Neurology, National Neuroscience Institute; Duke- NUS Medical School; Lee Kong Chian School of	Misleading content/ conclusions in publication Confirmed*     duplicate publication (unclear which publications you suggest Guevarra et al.)

TABLE 2: Papers published or endorsed on the STROKOG Webpage which you have mentioned in the complaint

Table Item	Paper published by STROKOG
1	Lo, Jessica W., John D. Crawford, David W. Desmond, Olivier Godefroy, Hanna Jokinen, Simin Mahinrad, Hee-Joon Bae et al. "Profile of and risk factors for poststroke cognitive
2	Lo, Jessica W; Crawford, John D; Samaras, Katherine; Desmond, David W; Köhler, Sebastian; Kim, Beom Joon; Bordet, Régis; Cordonnier, Charlotte; Dondaine, Thibaut; Men
3	Tang, Eugene YH, Christopher I. Price, Louise Robinson, Catherine Exley, David W. Desmond, Sebastian Köhler, Julie Staals et al. "Assessing the Predictive Validity of Simple
4	Sachdev, Perminder S., Jessica W. Lo, John D. Crawford, Lisa Mellon, Anne Hickey, David Williams, Régis Bordet et al. "STROKOG (stroke and cognition consortium): An inte

## **Notes**

\* Misleading content or conclusions in publication

I agree these points are correctly identified.

‡ Misrepresentation and putative falsification in Yatawara et al. 2020a

My apologies for not clarifying sufficiently in the report. In Yatawara et al. 2020a, it is stated that "...Microbleed etiologies of interest involved micro-bleeds which were CAA-related, defined usi

§ Putative duplicate results in Low et al. 2019b

These are: (i) Low et al. 2019c; (ii) Chander et al. 2018; and (iii) Foo et al. 2018.

## ¶ STROKOG Authors

I have no doubt that Lo and Sachdev are <u>not</u> engaged in misconduct by Kandiah and others in Singapore contributing to STROKOG work. Indeed, had it not been for the accurate reporting as Worryingly, another UNSW and STROKOG collaborator in Singapore, Christopher Chen, is implicated in evidence I compiled and did not share. This evidence is placed in the context of ageir

## † Putative duplicate results in Guevarra et al. 2020

At least Kumar et al. 2020. In my opinion, work by Kandiah which may be duplicated with Guevarra et al. 2020 may also include studies putatively utilizing the Singapore Young Onset Demen

#### **Framework**

The work by UNSW Authors in question was done in Singapore and elsewhere. As the complaint is investigated under UNSW Research Misconduct Procedure, I believe it is most conducive Review Boards 'guidelines', or more accurately, recommendations; (iii) this is the framework in which the complaint is being investigated and to be complied with by UNSW Authors according

## **UNSW-Singapore collaboration and exchange**

From my experience and in my opinion, I may write that implementation by UNSW of its Research Code of Conduct is, thus far, enviable. Clearly, UNSW students and researchers may not exauthorities to make a commitment towards enforcing law and policy regulating research in autonomous institutes such as Nanyang Technological University.

Once again, I apologize for the delay in my reply. Please do not hesitate to contact me, and I may meet with you online should this facilitate the investigation.

Kind regards,

Mohamed Helmy

MD, PhD

helmy.m@gmail.com

helmy.m@protonmail.com

+65 83 555 817

10 Jurong Lake Link, #15-39

Singapore 648131

On Tue, 16 Mar 2021 at 07:18, UNSW Research Integrity <research.integrity@unsw.edu.au> wrote:

#### STRICTLY CONFIDENTIAL

Dear Dr Helmy,

I am writing to you in relation to the below correspondence regarding your complaint of 18 January 2021.

In the email dated 1 March 2021, Research Integrity requested you to review the information and confirm some details relating to you complaint.

Could you please provide these details by 29 March 2021.

Thank you.

#### **Dimitrios Pandioras**

Case Manager

Conduct & Integrity Office

Division of Equity Diversity & Inclusion

UNSW SYDNEY 2052

E: research.integrity@unsw.edu.au

W: http://research.unsw.edu.au

T: +61 2 9065 7255









CRICOS Provider Code 00098G

UNSW is located on the unceded territory of the Bedegal (Kensington campus), Gadigal (City and Paddington Campuses) and Ngunnawal peoples (UNSW Canberra) who are the Traditional Owners of the lands where each campus of UNSW is situated.

This email (including any attached files) is intended only for the addressee, it may contain confidential information. If you are not the addressee, you are notified that any transmission, distribution, printing or duplication of the

### IMPORTANT! Please ensure that you "reply all" to this email and do not alter the subject line when responding. If these instructions are not followed your reply may not be received ###

From: UNSW Research Integrity <research.integrity@unsw.edu.au>

Sent: Monday, 1 March 2021 4:15 PM

To: helmy.m@gmail.com; PVC Track In Insight CRM <trackincrm@unsw.edu.au>

Cc: UNSW Research Integrity <research.integrity@unsw.edu.au>Subject: CMS-000001586 - Additional Information Required

## STRICTLY CONFIDENTIAL

Dear Dr Helmy,

Re: UNSW Actions regarding your Complaint of 18 January 2021 Our Ref: CMS-000001586

I am writing to you regarding UNSW's consideration of your complaint of 18 January 2021. I advise that an Interim Initial Assessment has been completed and the Designated Officer has d

It is important to note that your complaint is being considered under the UNSW Research Misconduct Procedure, which applies to Research undertaken by UNSW Researchers. The Desig

Below are 2 tables that include items which have been identified as relating to Research conducted (or published) by UNSW Researchers.

We request that you to review these tables and confirm the following.

- 1) Whether they are the only items from your complaint that relate to Research conducted (or published) by a Researcher at UNSW.
- 2) The specific nature of your concerns in relation to each Table Item in both Tables 1 and 2, particularly in relation to the queries listed in red text. The columns titled 'complaint type' and 'c Once we have received your clarification, the Designated Officer will review the information and you will be notified of the outcome of the Initial Assessment.

TABLE 1: Publications of concern with UNSW affiliation listed

Table Item	UNSW Authors	Corresponding Author	Complaint Type
1	Russell Chander (4th author) - Scientia PhD Candidate/ Research Assistant (UNSW)	Nagaendran Kandiah (Department of Neurology, National Neuroscience Institute; Duke- NUS Medical School; Lee Kong Chian School of Medicine, Singapore, Singapore,	Misleading content/ conlcusions in publication     duplicate publication

4	Russell Jude Chander (3rd author) - Scientia PhD Candidate/ Research Assistant (UNSW)	Nagaendran Kandiah (Department of Neurology, National Neuroscience Institute; Duke- NUS Medical School; Lee Kong Chian School of Medicine, Singapore, Singapore)	Misleading content/ conlcusions in publication     duplicate publication (unclear which publications you suggest Low et al.)
5	1. Jessica Lo 2. John D Crawford 3. Russell J Chander 4. Henry Brodaty 5. Darren M Lipnicki 6. Nicole A. Kochan 7. Perminder Sachdev	Perminder Sachdev (UNSW)	Unclear - possibly ethics again and possibly that Kandiah should not qualif
6	1. Jessica Lo 2. John D Crawford 3. Russell J Chander 4. Darren M Lipnicki 5. Perminder Sachdev 6. Katherine Samaras	Jessica Lo (UNSW)	Ethics Approval – please clarify if the concern is that participant consent st

Russell Jude Chander (5th Author) - Scientia PhD Candidate/ Research Assistant (UNSW)

Table Item	Paper published by STROKOG
1	Lo, Jessica W., John D. Crawford, David W. Desmond, Olivier Godefroy, Hanna Jokinen, Simin Mahinrad, Hee-Joon Bae et al. "Profile of and risk factors for poststroke cogn
2	Lo, Jessica W; Crawford, John D; Samaras, Katherine; Desmond, David W; Köhler, Sebastian; Kim, Beom Joon; Bordet, Régis; Cordonnier, Charlotte; Dondaine, Thibaut; M
3	Tang, Eugene YH, Christopher I. Price, Louise Robinson, Catherine Exley, David W. Desmond, Sebastian Köhler, Julie Staals et al. "Assessing the Predictive Validity of Simple Processing the Predictive Validity of Simple Predictive Validity of Simp

Singapore)

2. duplicate publication (unclear which publications you suggest Guevarra

Sachdev, Perminder S., Jessica W. Lo, John D. Crawford, Lisa Mellon, Anne Hickey, David Williams, Régis Bordet et al. "STROKOG (stroke and cognition consortium): An ir

If you have any questions, please don't hesitate to contact me.

#### Amelia Kowalski

Team Leader - Research Integrity, Conduct & Integrity Office

UNSW SYDNEY NSW 2052 AUSTRALIA

E: research\_integrity@unsw.edu\_au

T: +61 2 9385 3553

W: http://research.unsw.edu.au

Explore: Research Integrity at UNSW







CRICOS Provider Code 00098G

This email (including any attached files) is intended only for the addressee, it may contain confidential information. If you are not the addressee, you are notified that any transmission, distribution, printing

### IMPORTANT! Please ensure that you "reply all"to this email and do not alter the subject line when responding. If these instructions are no

## Mohamed Helmy <helmy.m@gmail.com>

To: UNSW Research Integrity <research.integrity@unsw.edu.au>
Cc: PVC Track In Insight CRM <trackincrm@unsw.edu.au>, UNSW Research Integrity <research.integrity@unsw.edu.au>

Dear Amelia and Dimitrios,

Thank you kindly for your message.

Warm regards, Mohamed Helmy MD, PhD

helmy.m@gmail.com helmv.m@protonmail.com +65 83 555 817 10 Jurong Lake Link, #15-39 Singapore 648131

On Tue, 30 Mar 2021 at 13:04, UNSW Research Integrity <research.integrity@unsw.edu.au> wrote:

# STRICTLY CONFIDENTIAL

Dear Dr Helmy,

Thank you for providing the requested information.

We will assess the information and provide you with an update as the Initial Assessment progresses.

Thank you.

#### **Dimitrios Pandioras**

Case Manager

Conduct & Integrity Office

Division of Equity Diversity & Inclusion

UNSW SYDNEY 2052

E: research.integrity@unsw.edu.au

W: http://research.unsw.edu.au

T: +61 2 9065 7255









CRICOS Provider Code 00098G

UNSW is located on the unceded territory of the Bedegal (Kensington campus), Gadigal (City and Paddington Campuses) and Ngunnawal peoples (UNSW Canberra) who are the Traditional Owners of the lands where each campus of UNSW is situated.

This email (including any attached files) is intended only for the addressee, it may contain confidential information. If you are not the addressee, you are notified that any transmission, distribution, printing or duplication of th

### IMPORTANT! Please ensure that you "reply all" to this email and do not alter the subject line when responding. If these instructions are not followed your reply may not be received ###

From: Mohamed Helmy <a href="mailto:helmy.m@gmail.com">helmy.m@gmail.com</a>>
Sent: Tuesday, 23 March 2021 5:43 PM

To: UNSW Research Integrity <a href="mailto:research.integrity@unsw.edu.au">research.integrity@unsw.edu.au</a>
Cc: PVC Track In Insight CRM <a href="mailto:research.integrity@unsw.edu.au">research.integrity@unsw.edu.au</a> Subject: Re: CMS-000001586 - Additional Information Required

Dear Amelia and Dimitrios,

My sincere apologies for the delay in replying. The efforts to silence me in Singapore are vicious and I spend an inordinate amount of time defending myself.

I am reassured by your comprehensive and thorough address of the complaint. Thank you for returning to me confidence that there is such a thing as due process.

I address the points raised, below in-line in blue text with reference to notes below the tables:

1) Whether they are the only items from your complaint that relate to Research conducted (or published) by a Researcher at UNSW.

Yes, these are the only items from my complaint related to Research conducted (or published) by a Researcher at UNSW.

2) The specific nature of your concerns in relation to eachTable Item in both Tables 1 and 2, particularly in relation to the queries listed in red text. The columns titled 'complaint type' and 'cc Please see below for clarifications.

TABLE 1: Publications of concern with UNSW affiliation listed

Table Item	UNSW Authors	Corresponding Author	Complaint Type
1	Russell Chander (4th author) - Scientia PhD Candidate/ Research Assistant (UNSW)	Nagaendran Kandiah (Department of Neurology,	Misleading content/ conlcusions in publication Confirmed*     duplicate publication Confirmed*

	National Neuroscience Institute; Duke- NUS Medical School; Lee Kong Chian School of Medicine, Singapore, Singapore)	
Russell Chander (4th author) - Scientia PhD Candidate/ Research Assistant (UNSW)	Nagaendran Kandiah (Department of Neurology, National Neuroscience Institute; Duke- NUS Medical School; Lee Kong Chian School of Medicine, Singapore, Singapore,	1. Misleading content/ confluence* 2. duplicate publication Confirmed* 3. not clear Misrepresenting and putatively falsifying research data;    Confirmed

٠.				· ·
	3	Heidi Foo (4th author) - PhD Candidate (UNSW)	Nagaendran Kandiah (Department of Neurology, National Neuroscience Institute; Duke- NUS Medical School; Lee Kong Chian School of Medicine, Singapore, Singapore)	"putatively duplicated work 2018-2020" Confirmed*
	4	Russell Jude Chander (3rd author) - Scientia PhD Candidate/ Research Assistant (UNSW)	Nagaendran Kandiah (Department of Neurology, National Neuroscience Institute; Duke- NUS Medical School; Lee Kong Chian School of Medicine, Singapore, Singapore)	1. Misleading content/ conlcusions in publication Confirmed* 2. duplicate publication (unclear which publications you suggest Low et al 2 Please see§
	5	1. Jessica Lo 2. John D Crawford 3. Russell J Chander 4. Henry Brodaty 5. Darren M Lipnicki 6. Nicole A. Kochan 7. Perminder Sachdev	Perminder Sachdev (UNSW)	Unclear - possibly ethics again and possibly that Kandiah should not qualify

		o maditional	mornia de la regalie d
		1	
6		Jessica Lo	Ethics Approval – please clarify if the concern is that participant consent s
	1. Jessica Lo	(UNSW)	
	2. John D Crawford	, ,	
	3. Russell J Chander		
	4. Darren M Lipnicki		
	5. Perminder Sachdev		
	6. Katherine Samaras		
		Nagaendran	
		Kandiah	
		(Department of	
		Neurology, National	
		Neuroscience Institute; Duke-	
		NUS Medical	
		School; Lee	
		Kong Chian	
		School of	
		Medicine,	Misleading content/ conclusions in publication Confirmed*
		Singapore,	
7	Russell Jude Chander (5th Author) - Scientia PhD Candidate/ Research Assistant (UNSW)	Singapore)	2. duplicate publication (unclear which publications you suggest Guevarra
	<u> </u>		

Table Item	Paper published by STROKOG	
1	Lo, Jessica W., John D. Crawford, David W. Desmond, Olivier Godefroy, Hanna Jokinen, Simin Mahinrad, Hee-Joon Bae et al. "Profile of and risk factors for poststroke cogn	

2	Lo, Jessica W; Crawford, John D; Samaras, Katherine; Desmond, David W; Köhler, Sebastian; Kim, Beom Joon; Bordet, Régis; Cordonnier, Charlotte; Dondaine, Thibaut; M
3	Tang, Eugene YH, Christopher I. Price, Louise Robinson, Catherine Exley, David W. Desmond, Sebastian Köhler, Julie Staals et al. "Assessing the Predictive Validity of Simple Control of the Control of Simple Control of Simple Control of the Control of Simple Control of Contro
4	Sachdev, Perminder S., Jessica W. Lo, John D. Crawford, Lisa Mellon, Anne Hickey, David Williams, Régis Bordet et al. "STROKOG (stroke and cognition consortium): An in

#### **Notes**

#### \* Misleading content or conclusions in publication

I agree these points are correctly identified.

# ‡ Misrepresentation and putative falsification in Yatawara et al. 2020a

My apologies for not clarifying sufficiently in the report. In Yatawara et al. 2020a, it is stated that "...Microbleed etiologies of interest involved micro-bleeds which were CAA-related, defined under the control of the control of

## § Putative duplicate results in Low et al. 2019b

These are: (i) Low et al. 2019c; (ii) Chander et al. 2018; and (iii) Foo et al. 2018.

#### ¶ STROKOG Authors

I have no doubt that Lo and Sachdev are <u>not</u> engaged in misconduct by Kandiah and others in Singapore contributing to STROKOG work. Indeed, had it not been for the accurate reporting Worryingly, another UNSW and STROKOG collaborator in Singapore, Christopher Chen, is implicated in evidence I compiled and did not share. This evidence is placed in the context of ag

## † Putative duplicate results in Guevarra et al. 2020

At least Kumar et al. 2020. In my opinion, work by Kandiah which may be duplicated with Guevarra et al. 2020 may also include studies putatively utilizing the Singapore Young Onset Dem

## **Framework**

The work by UNSW Authors in question was done in Singapore and elsewhere. As the complaint is investigated under UNSW Research Misconduct Procedure, I believe it is most conductive Review Boards 'guidelines', or more accurately, recommendations; (iii) this is the framework in which the complaint is being investigated and to be complied with by UNSW Authors according to the complaint is being investigated and to be complied with by UNSW Authors according to the complaint is being investigated and to be complied with by UNSW Authors according to the complaint is being investigated and to be complied with by UNSW Authors according to the complaint is being investigated and to be complied with by UNSW Authors according to the complaint is being investigated and to be complied with by UNSW Authors according to the complaint is being investigated and to be complied with by UNSW Authors according to the complaint is being investigated and to be complied with by UNSW Authors according to the complaint is being investigated and to be complied with by UNSW Authors according to the complete with the comp

# **UNSW-Singapore collaboration and exchange**

From my experience and in my opinion, I may write that implementation by UNSW of its Research Code of Conduct is, thus far, enviable. Clearly, UNSW students and researchers may not authorities to make a commitment towards enforcing law and policy regulating research in autonomous institutes such as Nanyang Technological University.

Once again, I apologize for the delay in my reply. Please do not hesitate to contact me, and I may meet with you online should this facilitate the investigation.

Kind regards,

Mohamed Helmy MD, PhD

helmy.m@gmail.com

helmy.m@protonmail.com

+65 83 555 817

10 Jurong Lake Link, #15-39

Singapore 648131

On Tue, 16 Mar 2021 at 07:18, UNSW Research Integrity <a href="mailto:research.integrity@unsw.edu.au">research.integrity@unsw.edu.au</a> wrote:

#### STRICTLY CONFIDENTIAL

Dear Dr Helmy,

I am writing to you in relation to the below correspondence regarding your complaint of 18 January 2021.

In the email dated 1 March 2021, Research Integrity requested you to review the information and confirm some details relating to you complaint.

Could you please provide these details by 29 March 2021.

Thank you.

#### **Dimitrios Pandioras**

Case Manager

Conduct & Integrity Office

Division of Equity Diversity & Inclusion

UNSW SYDNEY 2052

E: research.integrity@unsw.edu.au

W: http://research.unsw.edu.au

T: +61 2 9065 7255











CRICOS Provider Code 00098G

UNSW is located on the unceded territory of the Bedegal (Kensington campus). Gadigal (City and Paddington Campuses) and Ngunnawal peoples (UNSW Canberra) who are the Traditional Owners of the lands where each campus of UNSW is situated

This email (including any attached files) is intended only for the addressee, it may contain confidential information. If you are not the addressee, you are notified that any transmission, distribution, printing or duplication o

### IMPORTANT! Please ensure that you "reply all" to this email and do not alter the subject line when responding. If these instructions are not followed your reply may not be received ###

From: UNSW Research Integrity <research.integrity@unsw.edu.au>

Sent: Monday, 1 March 2021 4:15 PM

To: helmy.m@gmail.com; PVC Track In Insight CRM <trackincrm@unsw.edu.au>

Cc: UNSW Research Integrity <research.integrity@unsw.edu.au>Subject: CMS-000001586 - Additional Information Required

## STRICTLY CONFIDENTIAL

Dear Dr Helmy,

Re: UNSW Actions regarding your Complaint of 18 January 2021 Our Ref: CMS-000001586

I am writing to you regarding UNSW's consideration of your complaint of 18 January 2021. I advise that an Interim Initial Assessment has been completed and the Designated Officer has

It is important to note that your complaint is being considered under the UNSW Research Misconduct Procedure, which applies to Research undertaken by UNSW Researchers. The Det

Below are 2 tables that include items which have been identified as relating to Research conducted (or published) by UNSW Researchers.

We request that you to review these tables and confirm the following.

- 1) Whether they are the only items from your complaint that relate to Research conducted (or published) by a Researcher at UNSW.
- 2) The specific nature of your concerns in relation to each Table Item in both Tables 1 and 2, particularly in relation to the queries listed in red text. The columns titled 'complaint type' and Once we have received your clarification, the Designated Officer will review the information and you will be notified of the outcome of the Initial Assessment.

TABLE 1: Publications of concern with UNSW affiliation listed

1		ı	
Table Item	UNSW Authors	Corresponding Author	Complaint Type
1	Russell Chander (4th author) - Scientia PhD Candidate/ Research Assistant (UNSW)	Nagaendran Kandiah (Department of Neurology, National Neuroscience Institute; Duke- NUS Medical School; Lee Kong Chian School of Medicine, Singapore, Singapore,	Misleading content/ conlcusions in publication     duplicate publication
2	Russell Chander (4th author) - Scientia PhD Candidate/ Research Assistant (UNSW)	Nagaendran Kandiah (Department of Neurology, National Neuroscience Institute; Duke- NUS Medical School; Lee Kong Chian School of Medicine, Singapore, Singapore)	1. Misleading content/ conlcusions in publication 2. duplicate publication 3. not clear

4/27	7/23, 7:4	10 AM	Gmail - CMS-000001586 -	- Additional Info	ormation Required
		3	Heidi Foo (4th author) - PhD Candidate (UNSW)	Nagaendran Kandiah (Department of Neurology, National Neuroscience Institute; Duke- NUS Medical School; Lee Kong Chian School of Medicine, Singapore, Singapore)	"putatively duplicated work 2018-2020"
		4	Russell Jude Chander (3rd author) - Scientia PhD Candidate/ Research Assistant (UNSW)	Nagaendran Kandiah (Department of Neurology, National Neuroscience Institute; Duke- NUS Medical School; Lee Kong Chian School of Medicine, Singapore, Singapore)	Misleading content/ confcusions in publication     duplicate publication (unclear which publications you suggest Low e
		5	1. Jessica Lo 2. John D Crawford 3. Russell J Chander 4. Henry Brodaty 5. Darren M Lipnicki 6. Nicole A. Kochan 7. Perminder Sachdev	Perminder Sachdev (UNSW)	Unclear - possibly ethics again and possibly that Kandiah should not q

4/27	7/23, 7:4	40 AM	Gmail - CMS-000001586 -	- Additional Info	ormation Required
		6	1. Jessica Lo 2. John D Crawford 3. Russell J Chander 4. Darren M Lipnicki 5. Perminder Sachdev 6. Katherine Samaras	Jessica Lo (UNSW)	Ethics Approval – please clarify if the concern is that participant conse
		7	Russell Jude Chander (5th Author) - Scientia PhD Candidate/ Research Assistant (UNSW)	Nagaendran Kandiah (Department of Neurology, National Neuroscience Institute; Duke- NUS Medical School; Lee Kong Chian School of Medicine, Singapore, Singapore,	Misleading content/ conclusions in publication     duplicate publication (unclear which publications you suggest Gueval)

Table Item	Paper published by STROKOG
1	Lo, Jessica W., John D. Crawford, David W. Desmond, Olivier Godefroy, Hanna Jokinen, Simin Mahinrad, Hee-Joon Bae et al. "Profile of and risk factors for poststroke co
2	Lo, Jessica W; Crawford, John D; Samaras, Katherine; Desmond, David W; Köhler, Sebastian; Kim, Beom Joon; Bordet, Régis; Cordonnier, Charlotte; Dondaine, Thibaut;
3	Tang, Eugene YH, Christopher I. Price, Louise Robinson, Catherine Exley, David W. Desmond, Sebastian Köhler, Julie Staals et al. "Assessing the Predictive Validity of Si
4	Sachdev, Perminder S., Jessica W. Lo, John D. Crawford, Lisa Mellon, Anne Hickey, David Williams, Régis Bordet et al. "STROKOG (stroke and cognition consortium): Ar

If you have any questions, please don't hesitate to contact me.

## Amelia Kowalski

Team Leader - Research Integrity, Conduct & Integrity Office

UNSW SYDNEY NSW 2052 AUSTRALIA

E: research.integrity@unsw.edu.au

T: +61 2 9385 3553

W: http://research.unsw.edu.au

Explore: Research Integrity at UNSW









CRICOS Provider Code 00098G

This email (including any attached files) is intended only for the addressee, it may contain confidential information. If you are not the addressee, you are notified that any transmission, distribution, printir

### IMPORTANT! Please ensure that you "reply all"to this email and do not alter the subject line when responding. If these instructions are i